

1 HONORABLE RICHARD A. JONES  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9

10 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
11 WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
12 AT SEATTLE  
13  
14

15 MORGAN BARTLETT, et al.,  
16 Plaintiffs,  
17 v.  
18  
19

20 SAFECO INSURANCE COMPANY,  
21 Defendant.  
22

CASE NO. C13-1658 RAJ  
ORDER  
23

24 This matter comes before the court on an expedited Local Civil Rule 37 motion.  
25 Dkt. # 9; Local Rules W.D. Wash. CR (“LCR”) 37. Defendant moves for an order  
26 allowing a structural engineer to inspect plaintiffs’ vacation home on Whidbey Island  
27 under Rule 34. Plaintiff opposes and requests the court to deny defendant’s motion and  
to enter a protective order pursuant to Rule 26(c).<sup>1</sup>

28 On January 30, 2013, plaintiffs’ home on Whidbey Island was destroyed. The  
29 parties dispute the cause: Plaintiffs claim that the damage was caused by a tree, which is  
30

31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91  
92  
93  
94  
95  
96  
97  
98  
99  
100  
101  
102  
103  
104  
105  
106  
107  
108  
109  
110  
111  
112  
113  
114  
115  
116  
117  
118  
119  
120  
121  
122  
123  
124  
125  
126  
127  
128  
129  
130  
131  
132  
133  
134  
135  
136  
137  
138  
139  
140  
141  
142  
143  
144  
145  
146  
147  
148  
149  
150  
151  
152  
153  
154  
155  
156  
157  
158  
159  
160  
161  
162  
163  
164  
165  
166  
167  
168  
169  
170  
171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176  
177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182  
183  
184  
185  
186  
187  
188  
189  
190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196  
197  
198  
199  
200  
201  
202  
203  
204  
205  
206  
207  
208  
209  
210  
211  
212  
213  
214  
215  
216  
217  
218  
219  
220  
221  
222  
223  
224  
225  
226  
227  
228  
229  
230  
231  
232  
233  
234  
235  
236  
237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243  
244  
245  
246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259  
260  
261  
262  
263  
264  
265  
266  
267  
268  
269  
270  
271  
272  
273  
274  
275  
276  
277  
278  
279  
280  
281  
282  
283  
284  
285  
286  
287  
288  
289  
290  
291  
292  
293  
294  
295  
296  
297  
298  
299  
300  
301  
302  
303  
304  
305  
306  
307  
308  
309  
310  
311  
312  
313  
314  
315  
316  
317  
318  
319  
320  
321  
322  
323  
324  
325  
326  
327  
328  
329  
330  
331  
332  
333  
334  
335  
336  
337  
338  
339  
340  
341  
342  
343  
344  
345  
346  
347  
348  
349  
350  
351  
352  
353  
354  
355  
356  
357  
358  
359  
360  
361  
362  
363  
364  
365  
366  
367  
368  
369  
370  
371  
372  
373  
374  
375  
376  
377  
378  
379  
380  
381  
382  
383  
384  
385  
386  
387  
388  
389  
390  
391  
392  
393  
394  
395  
396  
397  
398  
399  
400  
401  
402  
403  
404  
405  
406  
407  
408  
409  
410  
411  
412  
413  
414  
415  
416  
417  
418  
419  
420  
421  
422  
423  
424  
425  
426  
427  
428  
429  
430  
431  
432  
433  
434  
435  
436  
437  
438  
439  
440  
441  
442  
443  
444  
445  
446  
447  
448  
449  
450  
451  
452  
453  
454  
455  
456  
457  
458  
459  
460  
461  
462  
463  
464  
465  
466  
467  
468  
469  
470  
471  
472  
473  
474  
475  
476  
477  
478  
479  
480  
481  
482  
483  
484  
485  
486  
487  
488  
489  
490  
491  
492  
493  
494  
495  
496  
497  
498  
499  
500  
501  
502  
503  
504  
505  
506  
507  
508  
509  
510  
511  
512  
513  
514  
515  
516  
517  
518  
519  
520  
521  
522  
523  
524  
525  
526  
527  
528  
529  
530  
531  
532  
533  
534  
535  
536  
537  
538  
539  
540  
541  
542  
543  
544  
545  
546  
547  
548  
549  
550  
551  
552  
553  
554  
555  
556  
557  
558  
559  
5510  
5511  
5512  
5513  
5514  
5515  
5516  
5517  
5518  
5519  
5520  
5521  
5522  
5523  
5524  
5525  
5526  
5527  
5528  
5529  
5530  
5531  
5532  
5533  
5534  
5535  
5536  
5537  
5538  
5539  
55310  
55311  
55312  
55313  
55314  
55315  
55316  
55317  
55318  
55319  
55320  
55321  
55322  
55323  
55324  
55325  
55326  
55327  
55328  
55329  
55330  
55331  
55332  
55333  
55334  
55335  
55336  
55337  
55338  
55339  
55340  
55341  
55342  
55343  
55344  
55345  
55346  
55347  
55348  
55349  
55350  
55351  
55352  
55353  
55354  
55355  
55356  
55357  
55358  
55359  
55360  
55361  
55362  
55363  
55364  
55365  
55366  
55367  
55368  
55369  
55370  
55371  
55372  
55373  
55374  
55375  
55376  
55377  
55378  
55379  
55380  
55381  
55382  
55383  
55384  
55385  
55386  
55387  
55388  
55389  
55390  
55391  
55392  
55393  
55394  
55395  
55396  
55397  
55398  
55399  
553100  
553101  
553102  
553103  
553104  
553105  
553106  
553107  
553108  
553109  
553110  
553111  
553112  
553113  
553114  
553115  
553116  
553117  
553118  
553119  
553120  
553121  
553122  
553123  
553124  
553125  
553126  
553127  
553128  
553129  
553130  
553131  
553132  
553133  
553134  
553135  
553136  
553137  
553138  
553139  
553140  
553141  
553142  
553143  
553144  
553145  
553146  
553147  
553148  
553149  
553150  
553151  
553152  
553153  
553154  
553155  
553156  
553157  
553158  
553159  
553160  
553161  
553162  
553163  
553164  
553165  
553166  
553167  
553168  
553169  
553170  
553171  
553172  
553173  
553174  
553175  
553176  
553177  
553178  
553179  
553180  
553181  
553182  
553183  
553184  
553185  
553186  
553187  
553188  
553189  
553190  
553191  
553192  
553193  
553194  
553195  
553196  
553197  
553198  
553199  
553200  
553201  
553202  
553203  
553204  
553205  
553206  
553207  
553208  
553209  
553210  
553211  
553212  
553213  
553214  
553215  
553216  
553217  
553218  
553219  
553220  
553221  
553222  
553223  
553224  
553225  
553226  
553227  
553228  
553229  
553230  
553231  
553232  
553233  
553234  
553235  
553236  
553237  
553238  
553239  
553240  
553241  
553242  
553243  
553244  
553245  
553246  
553247  
553248  
553249  
553250  
553251  
553252  
553253  
553254  
553255  
553256  
553257  
553258  
553259  
553260  
553261  
553262  
553263  
553264  
553265  
553266  
553267  
553268  
553269  
553270  
553271  
553272  
553273  
553274  
553275  
553276  
553277  
553278  
553279  
553280  
553281  
553282  
553283  
553284  
553285  
553286  
553287  
553288  
553289  
553290  
553291  
553292  
553293  
553294  
553295  
553296  
553297  
553298  
553299  
553300  
553301  
553302  
553303  
553304  
553305  
553306  
553307  
553308  
553309  
553310  
553311  
553312  
553313  
553314  
553315  
553316  
553317  
553318  
553319  
553320  
553321  
553322  
553323  
553324  
553325  
553326  
553327  
553328  
553329  
553330  
553331  
553332  
553333  
553334  
553335  
553336  
553337  
553338  
553339  
553340  
553341  
553342  
553343  
553344  
553345  
553346  
553347  
553348  
553349  
553350  
553351  
553352  
553353  
553354  
553355  
553356  
553357  
553358  
553359  
553360  
553361  
553362  
553363  
553364  
553365  
553366  
553367  
553368  
553369  
553370  
553371  
553372  
553373  
553374  
553375  
553376  
553377  
553378  
553379  
553380  
553381  
553382  
553383  
553384  
553385  
553386  
553387  
553388  
553389  
553390  
553391  
553392  
553393  
553394  
553395  
553396  
553397  
553398  
553399  
553400  
553401  
553402  
553403  
553404  
553405  
553406  
553407  
553408  
553409  
553410  
553411  
553412  
553413  
553414  
553415  
553416  
553417  
553418  
553419  
553420  
553421  
553422  
553423  
553424  
553425  
553426  
553427  
553428  
553429  
553430  
553431  
553432  
553433  
553434  
553435  
553436  
553437  
553438  
553439  
553440  
553441  
553442  
553443  
553444  
553445  
553446  
553447  
553448  
553449  
553450  
553451  
553452  
553453  
553454  
553455  
553456  
553457  
553458  
553459  
553460  
553461  
553462  
553463  
553464  
553465  
553466  
553467  
553468  
553469  
553470  
553471  
553472  
553473  
553474  
553475  
553476  
553477  
553478  
553479  
553480  
553481  
553482  
553483  
553484  
553485  
553486  
553487  
553488  
553489  
553490  
553491  
553492  
553493  
553494  
553495  
553496  
553497  
553498  
553499  
553500  
553501  
553502  
553503  
553504  
553505  
553506  
553507  
553508  
553509  
553510  
553511  
553512  
553513  
553514  
553515  
553516  
553517  
553518  
553519  
553520  
553521  
553522  
553523  
553524  
553525  
553526  
553527  
553528  
553529  
553530  
553531  
553532  
553533  
553534  
553535  
553536  
553537  
553538  
553539  
553540  
553541  
553542  
553543  
553544  
553545  
553546  
553547  
553548  
553549  
553550  
553551  
553552  
553553  
553554  
553555  
553556  
553557  
553558  
553559  
553560  
553561  
553562  
553563  
553564  
553565  
553566  
553567  
553568  
553569  
553570  
553571  
553572  
553573  
553574  
553575  
553576  
553577  
553578  
553579  
553580  
553581  
553582  
553583  
553584  
553585  
553586  
553587  
553588  
553589  
553590  
553591  
553592  
553593  
553594  
553595  
553596  
553597  
553598  
553599  
553600  
553601  
553602  
553603  
553604  
553605  
553606  
553607  
553608  
553609  
553610  
553611  
553612  
553613  
553614  
553615  
553616  
553617  
553618  
553619  
553620  
553621  
553622  
553623  
553624  
553625  
553626  
553627  
553628  
553629  
553630  
553631  
553632  
553633  
553634  
553635  
553636  
553637  
553638  
553639  
553640  
553641  
553642  
553643  
553644  
553645  
553646  
553647  
553648  
553649  
553650  
553651  
553652  
553653  
553654  
553655  
553656  
553657  
553658  
553659  
553660  
553661  
553662  
553663  
553664  
553665  
553666  
553667  
553668  
553669  
553670  
553671  
553672  
553673  
553674  
553675  
553676  
553677  
553678  
553679  
553680  
553681  
553682  
553683  
553684  
553685  
553686  
553687  
553688  
553689  
553690  
553691  
553692  
553693  
553694  
553695  
553696  
553697  
553698  
553699  
553700  
553701  
553702  
553703  
553704  
553705  
553706  
553707  
553708  
553709  
553710  
553711  
553712  
553713  
553714  
553715  
553716  
553717  
553718  
553719  
553720  
553721  
553722  
553723  
553724  
553725  
553726  
553727  
553728  
553729  
553730  
553731  
553732  
553733  
553734  
553735  
553736  
553737  
553738  
553739  
5537340  
5537341  
5537342  
5537343  
5537344  
5537345  
5537346  
5537347  
5537348  
5537349  
5537350  
5537351  
5537352  
5537353  
5537354  
5537355  
5537356  
5537357  
5537358  
5537359  
5537360  
5537361  
5537362  
5537363  
5537364  
5537365  
5537366  
5537367  
5537368  
5537369  
5537370  
5537371  
5537372  
5537373  
5537374  
5537375  
5537376  
5537377  
5537378  
5537379  
55373710  
55373711  
55373712  
55373713  
55373714  
55373715  
55373716  
55373717  
55373718  
55373719  
55373720  
55373721  
55373722  
55373723  
55373724  
55373725  
55373726  
55373727  
55373728  
55373729  
55373730  
55373731  
55373732  
55373733  
55373734  
55373735  
55373736  
55373737  
55373738  
55373739  
55373740  
55373741  
55373742  
55373743  
55373744  
55373745  
55373746  
55373747  
55373748  
55373749  
55373750  
55373751  
55373752  
55373753  
55373754  
55373755  
55373756  
55373757  
55373758  
55373759  
55373760  
55373761  
55373762  
55373763  
55373764  
55373765  
55373766  
55373767  
55373768  
55373769  
55373770  
55373771  
55373772  
55373773  
55373774  
55373775  
55373776  
55373777  
55373778  
55373779  
55373780  
55373781  
55373782  
55373783  
55373784  
55373785  
55373786  
55373787  
55373788  
55373789  
55373790  
55373791  
55373792  
55373793  
55373794  
55373795  
55373796  
55373797  
55373798  
55373799  
553737100  
553737101  
553737102  
553737103  
553737104  
553737105  
553737106  
553737107  
553737108  
553737109  
553737110  
553737111  
553737112  
553737113  
553737114  
553737115  
553737116  
553737117  
553737118  
553737119  
553737120  
553737121  
553737122  
553737123  
553737124  
553737125  
553737126  
553737127  
553737128  
553737129  
553737130  
553737131  
553737132  
553737133  
553737134  
553737135  
553737136  
553737137  
553737138  
553737139  
553737140  
553737141  
553737142  
553737143  
553737144  
553737145  
553737146  
553737147  
553737148  
553737149  
553737150  
553737151  
553737152  
553737153  
553737154  
553737155  
553737156  
553737157  
553737158  
553737159  
553737160  
553737161  
553737162  
553737163  
553737164  
553737165  
553737166  
553737167  
553737168  
553737169  
553737170  
553737171  
553737172  
553737173  
553737174  
553737175  
553737176  
553737177  
553737178  
553737179  
553737180  
553737181  
553737182  
553737183  
553737184  
553737185  
553737186  
553737187  
553737188  
553

1 covered, and defendant asserts that the damage was caused by debris flow originating in a  
 2 landslide, which is not covered. The parties also dispute whether plaintiffs initially  
 3 informed defendant that the damage was caused by a tree: Plaintiffs assert that they  
 4 reported that the house was damaged by a falling tree when they first reported the loss,  
 5 and defendant asserts that plaintiffs' insurance agent reported that a landslide had  
 6 occurred and half buried the home. Plaintiffs represent that defendant sent an inspector  
 7 on February 1, 2013 to take pictures and measurements and to analyze the scene.<sup>2</sup> On  
 8 February 13, 2013, defendant sent a geotechnical engineer to inspect the property. On  
 9 March 15, 2013, the geotechnical engineer determined that the cause of the damage to the  
 10 home was debris flow originating in a landslide. Dkt. # 10-1 at 6 (Ex. 1 to Abendschein  
 11 Decl.). On April 12, 2013, counsel for plaintiffs provided the report of General  
 12 Contractor Paul L. Johnson, who opined that the loss was caused by a falling tree. Dkt. #  
 13 10-3 at 4 (Ex. 3 to Abendschein Decl.). In response, defendant requested an inspection  
 14 by a structural engineer, which plaintiffs denied. Plaintiffs filed suit on August 13, 2013,  
 15 and the case was removed to this court on September 13, 2013. On October 25, 2013,  
 16 defendant propounded its Rule 34 request for inspection of land for Monday, November  
 17 25, 2013. The parties met and conferred and filed the pending Rule 37 expedited motion.

18       The court has broad discretion to control discovery. *Avila v. Willits Envtl.*  
 19 *Remediation Trust*, 633 F.3d 828, 833 (9th Cir. 2011). That discretion is guided by  
 20 several principles. Most importantly, the scope of discovery is broad. A party must  
 21 respond to any discovery request that is “reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of  
 22 admissible evidence.” Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(1). The court, however, must limit  
 23 discovery where its “burden or expense . . . outweighs its likely benefit, considering the  
 24 needs of the case, the amount in controversy, the parties’ resources, the importance of the

---

26       <sup>2</sup> Plaintiffs represent that the first inspector was Diane L. Starling, whose credentials  
 27 include an Associate in Management and an Associate in Claims.

1 issues at stake in the action, and the importance of the discovery in resolving these  
2 issues.” Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(2)(C)(iii). A party may move the court for a protective  
3 order from “annoyance, embarrassment, oppression or undue burden or expense,  
4 including . . . forbidding the disclosure or discovery . . . [and] forbidding inquiry into  
5 certain matters, or limiting the scope of disclosure or discovery to certain matters[.]”  
6 Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(c)(1)(A) & (D).<sup>3</sup> “If a motion for a protective order is wholly or partly  
7 denied, the court may, on just terms, order that any party or person provide or permit  
8 discovery.” Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(c)(2). Rule 34 permits entry onto property possessed or  
9 controlled by a party to inspect, measure, survey, photograph, test, or sample the property  
10 or any designated object or operation on it. Fed. R. Civ. P. 34(a)(2).

11 Defendant has not previously propounded a Rule 34 request. The court recognizes  
12 that two individuals have previously inspected the property prior to this lawsuit being  
13 filed. However, the inspection is not cumulative because defendant has not had a  
14 structural engineer examine the property to determine the cause of the loss. The court  
15 finds that plaintiffs have not demonstrated good cause to prohibit the Rule 34 inspection  
16 because the request is not unreasonably cumulative or burdensome. Plaintiffs readily  
17 admit that they are not currently living at the destroyed property. There is no evidence  
18 that they will be unduly burdened by the inspection.<sup>4</sup> Additionally, plaintiffs are parties  
19 to this action, not third parties whose privacy interests may be at risk. Finally, the court

<sup>3</sup> The court notes that plaintiffs have not moved the court for a protective order. Rather, plaintiffs have asked the court for a protective order in opposition to defendant's motion to compel inspection of the land. Nevertheless, for purposes of this order, the court will consider plaintiffs' request as a motion this time.

<sup>4</sup> Plaintiffs argue that if the Bartletts are forced to keep the house in its current condition until November 25, it will be impossible, due to the onset of winter weather, to do anything with the house until Spring 2014. This motion was noted on the court's calendar for November 13, 2013. The court was unable to render a decision on this motion until today due to its heavy docket. Accordingly, the court finds that waiting a few more days until November 25, 2013 will not change the outcome of the arrival of winter weather at this point.

1 finds that an inspection by a structural engineer is material to defendant's defense  
2 regarding the cause of the loss.

3 For all of the foregoing reasons, the court GRANTS defendant's motion to compel  
4 inspection of land pursuant to Rule 34. Dkt. # 9. The inspection shall proceed on  
5 November 25, 2013 as scheduled. Dkt. # 11 at 23-25.

6

7 Dated this 21st day of November, 2013.

8   
9

10 The Honorable Richard A. Jones  
11 United States District Judge

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27  
ORDER- 4